



THE BRUEG(H)EL PHENOMENON

Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger With a Special Focus on Technique and Copying Practice

Christina CURRIE and Dominique ALLART

Contents

Preface

Acknowledgements

Note to the Reader

INTRODUCTION

A GREAT PAINTER OF THE RENAISSANCE, HIS HEIR AND COPYIST AND THE ANTWERP ART MARKET

- A Brilliant Dynasty of Painters
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder: His Life and Work
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Posthumous Fame
- Proliferation of Copies After Pieter Bruegel the Elder at the End of the Sixteenth Century
- Pieter Brueghel the Younger: His Life and Work
- *Inique facis nisi Patrem in Filio nosci*: Pieter Brueghel the Younger as Continuator of His Father
- The Art Market in Antwerp at the Time of Pieter Brueghel the Younger
- Reconstructing Antwerp Workshops' Organisational Practices
- *Rechte princepalen!* The Rise of Connoisseurship
- The Works of Pieter Brueghel the Younger in Seventeenth Century Antwerp Inventories
- Signatures and Dates in Bruegel the Elder's and Brueghel the Younger's Works

THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER: CASE STUDIES

- *Status Quaestionis*
- Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined
- ***The Census at Bethlehem* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)**
 - Provenance
 - Inscriptions
 - Painting Support
 - Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges - Condition
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Drawing Medium - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Modifications During Painting
 - Conclusion
- ***The Sermon of St John the Baptist* (Budapest, Szépművészeti Múzeum)**
 - Provenance
 - Inscriptions

- Painting Support
 - Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges - Condition
- Preparatory Layers
- Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
- Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting – Brushwork and Handling - Gesture and Expression - Modifications During Painting
- Conclusion
- ***The Winter Landscape with Bird Trap* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)**
 - Provenance, Rediscovery and Early Controversy
 - Inscriptions
 - Fingerprint
 - Painting Support
 - Format and Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Condition
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - The Place of the Underdrawing in the Evolution of the Composition - An Early Drawing of the Composition
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
 - Conclusion
- ***The Adoration of the Magi* (Winterthur, Dr Oskar Reinhart Collection ‘Am Römerholz’)**
 - Provenance
 - Inscriptions
 - Painting Support
 - Format and Construction - Condition
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
 - Conclusion

PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER’S PANEL PAINTING TECHNIQUE: A REASSESSMENT

- **Painting Supports**
 - Format and Construction
 - *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges
- **Preparatory Layers**
 - Ground
 - *Imprimatura*
- **Underdrawing**
 - Drawing Materials
 - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
 - Underdrawing Styles and Modifications During Drawing and Painting
- **Painting Techniques**
 - Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
 - Sequence of Painting
 - Brushwork and Handling

THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER AND HIS STUDIO: CASE STUDIES

- *Status Quaestionis*
- Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined
- **Copies of the *Battle between Carnival and Lent* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
 - Inscriptions

- Painting Supports
 - Format and Panel Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Transfer of the Design to the Prepared Panel Surface: Evidence for the Use of Pricked Cartoons
 - A Series of Smaller Cartoons rather than a Whole Sheet
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Modifications in Relation to the Pounced Design - Style
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
 - The Original Model and the Cartoon
 - The Possible Whereabouts of the Original Version at the Time of Brueghel the Younger - The Original Version and the Five Copies: A Comparison - The Christie's New York Version - The Portland Version - A Hierarchy of Copies - The Source of the Cartoon
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Census at Bethlehem After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - The Panel Maker and Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Modifications During Underdrawing and Painting - Stylistic Variation and the Question of Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Reflections on Attribution - Style and Brushwork in Comparison to Bruegel the Elder's Original Version
 - The Model for the Copies
 - Key Elements Missing in the Copies Versus Bruegel the Elder's Original Painting - Key Elements Transformed in the Copies - Misinterpretation of Original Motifs - Elements in Underdrawing of Original, Dropped During Painting but Repeated in the Copies - Colours - Placement of Signature - Pre-conclusion
 - Variants Amongst the Copies
 - Five Variants and a Sub-variant - Motifs Varying According to Group - Dating - Secondary Models: Drawings, Underdrawings or Finished Paintings? - Four Groups - Pre-conclusion
 - Copying Process
 - Use of Cartoons - Transfer Process - The Source of the Cartoons
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Sermon of St John the Baptist After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing:
 - Form and Function - Style and Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - The Model for the Copies
 - Comparison of the Sons' Copies With Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version - Jan Brueghel and Pieter the Younger's Possible Working Relationship - Two Variants
 - Copying Process
 - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process - Partial Correlation with Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Winter Landscape with Bird Trap After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Attribution
 - Paint Layer

- Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - The Model for the Copies
 - Bruegel the Elder's Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België - The Case of the Painting in the Former M. A. Hassid Collection
 - Copying Process
 - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Two Additional Motifs in the Antwerp and Coppée-le Hodey Versions
 - Brueghel's Competition: Contemporary Copies and Variants Produced by Other Workshops
 - *Excursus* : A Late Nineteenth or Early Twentieth Century Copy
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Adoration of the Magi* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette, Paint Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - The Model for the Copies
 - Differences Between Bruegel the Elder's Original Version and the Copies - The Existence of Two Faithful Copies
 - Copying Process
 - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Differences Amongst the Copies - A Copy from Outside Brueghel the Younger's Studio
 - Conclusion
- ***The Magpie On the Gallows: A Unique Copy After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Support
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
 - The Model for the Copy
 - Bruegel the Elder's Original Version - A Version in the Former Bruno Donath Collection
 - Copying Process
 - Original Version and the Copy: A Comparison
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
- Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
 - Copy Process
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Adjustments in Design During Drawing and Painting - Drawing Notations - Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
 - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Motifs Not Present on the Cartoon - Colour - Searching For the Original Model - Evidence for a Lost Painting by Bruegel the Elder: Versions by Jan Brueghel and a Variant by Martin van Cleve
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Crucifixion* Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
- Inscriptions
 - Creation of a Compositional Variant and Collaboration with Joos de Momper the Younger

- Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
- Preparatory Layers
- Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Attribution
- Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Brushwork, Handling and Attribution - Sequence of Painting
- Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
 - Common Cartoons for the Figures - Townscape and Landscape Backgrounds: No Evidence for a Common Cartoon - Colour Correspondence in the Figures - Original Model - Hypothesis of a Lost *Crucifixion* by Bruegel the Elder: Source Documents - The Vienna Version of the *Crucifixion* by Jan Bruegel I - Searching For the Appearance of a Lost Original by Bruegel the Elder
- Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Massacre of the Innocents* Probably After a Lost Painting by Martin Van Cleve**
 - Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
 - Original Model - Transfer Process
 - The Brussels Version: Evidence of a Cover-up
 - The First Painting - Re-use of Panels in the Sixteenth Century - Why This Re-use In Bruegel's Workshop?
 - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Peasant Lawyer* After an Anonymous Model**
 - Inscriptions
 - Painting Supports
 - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
 - Preparatory Layers
 - Underdrawing
 - Form and Function - Attribution
 - Paint Layer
 - Condition - Palette and Pigments - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
 - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
 - Hypotheses as to Original Model - Two Variants - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process
 - Copies by Bruegel the Younger's Contemporaries and Later Imitators
 - Conclusion

DEMYSTIFYING THE PROCESS: PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER'S STUDIO PRACTICE

- **Painting Supports**
 - Format and Provenance of the Wood
 - *Barbes* and Unpainted Lateral Edges, with Corresponding Rebates on the Reverse
 - The Antwerp Brand and Panel-makers' Marks
 - Quality
- **Preparatory Layers**
 - Ground
 - *Imprimatura*
- **The Role of Cartoons**
 - The Transfer Process
 - Single or Partial Pricked Cartoons
 - The Nature of the Cartoons: The Notion of an Original Master Cartoon and Working 'Substitute Cartoons'
- **Underdrawing**
 - Graphite as Underdrawing Medium

- The Position of the Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
- The Extent and Character of the Underdrawing
- Cartoon Transfer and Underdrawing Step-by-Step
- **Painting Techniques**
 - Palette
 - Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
 - Sequence of Painting
 - Brushwork and Handling
 - Late Additions

SEARCHING FOR THE HAND OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER

- **The Underdrawings**
 - A Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
 - Underdrawings Outside the Core Group
 - Drawings in the Manner of Bruegel the Elder: The Question of Attribution
- **The Painting Stage**
 - A Core Group of Paintings by the Master
 - Paintings Outside the Core Group
 - Significance of a Signature

PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER'S MODELS AND THE ISSUE OF VARIANTS

- **Brueghel the Younger's Models**
 - Paintings for which Bruegel the Elder's Original Versions Still Survive
 - Paintings Presumed to be After Lost Works by Bruegel the Elder
 - Paintings After Missing Works by Other Artists
- **Variants and Variation in Brueghel the Younger's Production**
 - Compositional Variants
 - Variation in the Later Years
 - Organisation Practice Under Brueghel the Younger's Aegis

AROUND PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER: COPIES BY OTHER ARTISTS

- **Brueghelian Compositions Produced by Contemporary or Later Followers**
- **Observations on Two of Jan Brueghel the Elder's Copies**
- **Solving a Famous Controversy: The Fall of Icarus, Two Anonymous Copies**
 - History of the Controversy
 - The Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique – Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België in Brussels
 - Provenance - Support - Radiocarbon Dating - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
 - The Version in the Van Buuren Museum in Brussels
 - Provenance - Support - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
 - Conclusion

UNDERSTANDING THE FATHER THROUGH THE SON: LOST SECRETS OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER'S WORKING PRACTICE

- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Compositional Drawings
- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Cartoons
- Evidence from the Originals: The Nature of the Lost Cartoons
- Other Preparatory Material Employed by Bruegel
- Record Copies?
- Model Drawings and Preparatory Cartoons in the Southern Netherlands
- From Drawing to Painting: Bruegel's Creative Process Reconstructed

CONCLUSIONS

BIBLIOGRAPHY

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

PHOTOGRAPHIC CREDITS

APPENDICES

- **1. Historical Copying Techniques**
 - A Note on Cartoons - Squaring - Pouncing - Tracing - The Counterproof Method - Proportional Compasses - Pantograph - Mixed Methods of Transfer
- **2. Practical Reconstructions (Christina Currie, with the Collaboration of Bob Ghys)**
 - Preparation of Test Panels and Drawing Materials - Squaring - Tracing - Pouncing - Pantograph - Alternative Methods - Discussion
- **3. Paintings Studied from the Workshop of Pieter Brueghel the Younger: Dates, Signatures, Key Technical Features**
- **4. Identifying Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Underdrawing Medium (Christina Currie and Steven Saverwyns)**
 - Historical Context
 - Black Chalk - Graphite - Metalpoint
 - Identification of Underdrawing in Paint Samples
 - Analysis of Underdrawing in Brueghel the Younger's Paintings
 - Experimental Conditions - *Crucifixion* - *Massacre of the Innocents* - *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* - X-ray Fluorescence Analysis of Two Small Format Paintings by Brueghel the Younger - Experimental Conditions - Results
 - Conclusion
- **5. Dendro-archaeological Examination of Paintings by Pieter Brueghel the Younger (Pascale Fraiture)**
 - Provenance of the Wood, Mechanical and Technical Characteristics - Planks from the Same Tree in Different Paintings - Dating - Conclusion
- **6. Attribution in Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Production in the Works Studied**
 - Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
 - Core Group of Paintings by the Master
- **7. Charts of Variants**
 - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Census at Bethlehem* Series
 - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Sermon of St John the Baptist* Series
 - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Peasant Lawyer* Series

This volume will be published in the IRPA/KIK *Scientia Artis* series in 2011.

